

## Notes

### Introduction

Epigraphs: Jean Baudrillard, *The Evil Demon of Images* (Sidney, 1988), 23; Jean Amery, *At the Mind's Limits: Contemplations by a Survivor on Auschwitz and Its Realities*, trans. Sidney Rosenfeld and Stella P. Rosenfeld (Bloomington, 1980), 84; André Schwarz-Bart, *The Last of the Just*, trans. Stephen Becker (London, 1961), 409.

1. Arthur Danto, "The Vietnam Veterans Memorial," *The Nation*, 31 Aug. 1986: 152. This particular definition is repeated in an otherwise excellent analysis of the memorial by Marita Sturken, "The Wall, the Screen, and the Image: The Vietnam Veterans Memorial," *Representations* 35 (Summer 1991): 118–42.

2. Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Use and Abuse of History*, trans. Adrian Collins (New York, 1985), 14–17.

3. Lewis Mumford, *The Culture of Cities* (New York, 1938), 438.

4. For the full, much more complex, context of Broszat's remarks, see his series of letters to Saul Friedländer and Friedländer's excellent replies printed first in *Vierteljahreshefte für Zeitgeschichte* 36, no. 2 (April 1988): 339–72, subsequently translated and reprinted as "Martin Broszat/Saul Friedländer: A Controversy about the Historicization of National Socialism," in *Yad Vashem Studies* 19 (Fall 1988): 1–47; also reprinted in *New German Critique* 44 (Spring–Summer 1988): 85–126. The exchange between Broszat and Friedländer was initially sparked by Friedländer's response to Broszat's "Plädoyer für eine Historisierung des Nationalsozialismus" [Plea for a historicization of National Socialism], *Merkur* 39 (1985): 373–85.

Broszat's specific reference to monuments comes in his comments on "mythical memory," which he distinguishes from "scientific insight" (*New German Critique* 44 [Spring–Summer 1988]: 90–91).

5. Rosalind Krauss, *The Originality of the Avant-Garde and Other Modernist Myths* (Cambridge, Mass., and London, 1988), 280.

6. Pierre Nora, "Between Memory and History: *Les Lieux de Mémoire*," trans. Marc Roudebush, *Representations* 26 (1989): 13. Reprinted from Pierre Nora, "Entre mémoire et histoire," *Les Lieux de mémoire*, vol. 1: *La République* (Paris, 1984), xxvi.

7. John Hallmark Neff, "Introduction [to Public Art]: Daring to Dream," *Critical Inquiry* 16 (Summer 1990): 857.

8. See Maurice Halbwachs, *Les Cadres sociaux de la mémoire* (Paris, 1952); also see his *La Mémoire collective* (Paris, 1950).

9. From "Forwort," in *Sefer Yizkor le-kedoshei ir (Przedecz) Pshaytask Khurbanot ha'shoah*, p. 130, as quoted in Jack Kugelmass and Jonathan Boyarin, eds., *From a Ruined Garden: The Memorial Books of Polish Jewry* (New York, 1983), 11.

10. On the missing grave syndrome, see Joost Merloo, "Delayed Mourning in Victims of Extermination Camps," in Henry Krystal, ed., *Massive Psychic Trauma* (New York, 1968), 74.

11. See the catalogue for this exhibition, edited by Werner Fenz, *Bezugspunkte 38/88* (Graz, 1988). I discuss this installation at greater length in chapter 4.

12. For insights into this project by both the artist and curator, see Hans Haacke, "Und ihr habt doch gesiegt, 1988," and Werner Fenz, "The Monument Is Invisible, the Sign Visible," in *October* 48 (Spring 1989): 75–87.

13. See Albert Elsen, "What We Have Learned about Modern Public Sculpture: Ten Propositions," *Art Journal* 48, no. 4 (Winter 1989): 291. Also see Albert Elsen, *Rodin's "Thinker" and the Dilemmas of Modern Public Sculpture* (New Haven, 1985).

Without being too facetious in this context, we might speculate on what a monument to the Holocaust by video artist Nam June Paik might look like. Would it be a single video loop, replaying over and over images set in a concentration camp or deportation site? Or would he make an all-purpose monument, a chunk of marble, inset with a video monitor that played any memorial loop we wanted to insert? Depending on the day and location, this stone and video might commemorate Auschwitz, Hiroshima, or World War I—not to mention any number of future catastrophes.

14. For examples, see Albert E. Elsen, *Modern European Sculpture, 1918–1945: Unknown Beings and Other Realities* (New York, 1979), 122–25.

15. See Janet Blatter, "Art from the Whirlwind," in Janet Blatter and Sybil Milton, eds., *Art of the Holocaust* (London, 1982), 22–35.

16. For a much more comprehensive discussion of the difficulties in bearing literary witness, see James E. Young, "Interpreting Literary Testimony: A Preface to Rereading Holocaust Diaries and Memoirs," *New Literary History* 18 (Winter 1986–87): 403–23.

17. As might have been expected, even the most popular of abstract monuments, the Vietnam Veterans Memorial, was eventually forced to make concessions to the figurative demands of its public. Apparently dissatisfied with only seeing themselves reflected on its black marble surface, some of the veterans demanded a more figurative representation of "actual soldiers" nearby. As a result, a figurative statue of three representative soldiers was added to the setting—to be joined eventually by a figurative statue of nurses, also veterans, who served in Vietnam.

For discussion of the controversy surrounding the decision to add to Lin's original concept, see Elizabeth Hess, "A Tale of Two Memorials," *Art in America*, April 1983: 120–27; and Charles L. Griswold, "The Vietnam Veterans Memorial and the Washington Mall: Philosophical Thoughts on Political Iconography," *Critical Inquiry* 12 (Summer 1986): 688–719. Also see Jan C. Scruggs and Joel Swerdlow, *To Heal a Nation: The Vietnam Veterans Memorial* (New York, 1985).

18. See Peter Bürger, *The Theory of the Avant Garde*, trans. Michael Shaw (Minneapolis, 1984), 87. Bürger defines the "functional analysis of art" as an examination of the artwork's "social effect (function), which is the result of the coming together of stimuli emanating from within the work itself and a sociologically definable public."

19. Marianne Doezema, "The Public Monument in Tradition and Transition," in *The Public Monument and Its Audience* (Cleveland, 1977), 9.

20. Robert Musil, "Monuments," in *Posthumous Papers of a Living Author*, trans. Peter Wortsman (Hygiene, Colo., 1987), 61.

21. I suggested a similar critique of monuments in much rougher form in "Memory and Monument," in Geoffrey H. Hartman, ed., *Bitburg in Moral and Political Perspective* (Bloomington, 1986), 112; reprinted in expanded form in James E. Young, *Writing and Rewriting the Holocaust: Narrative and the Consequences of Interpretation* (Bloomington, 1988).

For an excellent, much more fully adumbrated discussion of "the struggle between iconoclasm and idolatry," see W. J. T. Mitchell, *Iconology: Image, Text, Ideology* (Chicago and London, 1986), 160–208.

### Introduction to Part 1

1. In the rare event when a state does commemorate its crimes, it is nearly always at the behest of formerly victimized citizens. The memorial unveiled on 30 Oct. 1990 in Moscow, for example, to "the millions of victims of a totalitarian regime" was instigated by a group calling itself "Memorial," composed of scholars, cultural figures, dissidents, and former victims of Stalin's terror.

Likewise, a new monument by Maya Lin to the civil rights movement in Montgomery, Alabama—inscribed with the names of those who died for the cause—was commissioned and constructed by the Southern Poverty Law Center there, which had chronicled and prosecuted civil rights cases. In neither the Soviet nor American case did the state initiate the monument, but in both instances representatives of the state later endorsed these memorials—a move by which both current governments sought to create an official distance between themselves and past, guilty regimes.

2. Cited in Elizabeth Domansky, "How to Remember What to Remember: Jennings's Speech," paper given at a conference at Northwestern University entitled "Lessons and Legacies of the Holocaust," November 1989, p. 2.

3. In fact, what both sides of the *Historikerstreit* (Historians' Debate) in Germany seem to have in common is the resistance to remembering the Third Reich solely in the image of Auschwitz. The vociferous response inside Germany and out to Ernst Nolte's infamous charge that "certain interests," especially those of the persecuted (i.e., the Jews), kept Auschwitz in view only to sustain their privileged status among the nations, led to his revised explanation of the killings: that the Nazis committed "Asiatic deeds" only in fear of the deeds to be perpetrated upon the Germans by the Asiatics

18. We might recall in this context the Yad Vashem World Council's first convention was held in 1957 on 19 April (anniversary of the Warsaw Ghetto uprising), which fell that year on the Eighth of Iyar and not on the Twenty-seventh of Nissan, at Har Hazikkaron. After reading a number of letters, the chairman, Benzion Dinur, asked all to rise for a moment's silence. According to one report, "The council rose in a minute's silence in memory of the victims of the European holocaust and of those who fell in the defense of the homeland." In this equation, martyrs and fighters are united here by the memory of those who were both. See "Yad Washem World Council Convenes on Memorial Hill in Jerusalem," *Yad Vashem Bulletin*, April 1957: 31 (emphasis added).

19. From the Opening Ceremony of "Holocaust Martyrs' and Heroes' Remembrance Day, Nissan 26, 5747–May 1, 1989," courtesy of Yad Vashem Memorial Authority.

20. In Israel's more recent past, the long, steady siren acquired further memory still; it was the all-clear signal sounded in the wake of Iraqi missile attacks in January 1991.

21. Only one photograph I know, taken from the Tel Aviv–Jerusalem highway, conveys this sense of stopped motion. The stillness of the drivers standing at attention beside their cars outside is captured precisely by the figure of the roadway itself, which functions as a backdrop of assumed movement. See the photograph by Frederic Brenner in A. B. Yehoshua and Frederic Brenner, *Israel* (London, 1988), 2–3.

22. Benzion Dinur, "Problems of Research," *Yad [V]ashem Studies* 1 (1957): 9–10.

23. Arye L. Kubovy, "Nissan 27—A Day of Examen of Conscience," *Yad Vashem Bulletin*, June 1960: 2.

24. *Yad Vashem News* 2 (1970): 7.

25. David Golinkin, "Yom Hashoah: A Program of Observance," *Conservative Judaism* 37 (Summer 1984): 52–64; and "How Should We Commemorate the Shoah in Our Homes?" *Moment* 14 (June 1989): 30–35.

#### Introduction to Part 4

Epigraph: James Ingo Freed, "The United States Holocaust Memorial Museum," *Assemblage* 9 (1989): 61.

1. For a comprehensive survey and discussion of the Landsmanschaften memorials in New York City cemeteries, see Rabbi Alvin M. Poplack's doctoral dissertation, "Various Ways Jews Commemorated the Holocaust for Eternity by Permanent Memorials on Cemeteries in the Metropolitan New York Area" (Jewish Teachers Seminary, December 1981).

2. For more on the political dimension of memorials, see Michael Berenbaum, "On the Politics of Public Commemoration of the Holocaust," *Shoah*, Fall–Winter 1981–82: 9. Also see Berenbaum's collection of essays *After Tragedy and Triumph: Modern Jewish Thought and the American Experience* (Cambridge and New York, 1991), 3–16. For further details on the controversy surrounding the establishment of the U.S. Holocaust Memorial Commission, see Judith Miller, *One by One by One: Facing the Holocaust* (New York and London, 1990), 255–66.

3. From Alex Krieger's speech at the Founders' Dinner of the New England Holocaust Memorial Committee, 29 Nov. 1989, Boston.

#### Chapter 11. The Plural Faces of Holocaust Memory in America

1. From the Jewish Telegraphic Agency press bulletin, 2 Dec. 1942. I am grateful to Lucia Ruedenberg for bringing these announcements to my attention in her "Analysis of Civil Commemoration of the Holocaust in New York City" (January 1990), an unpublished essay from her doctoral dissertation in performance studies at New York University.

2. Citing a 1989 doctoral dissertation by Atay Citron, Lucia Ruedenberg reports that among the hundreds who performed in this pageant, twenty orthodox rabbis who had escaped from Nazi-occupied Europe held up torn Torah scrolls and recited the Kaddish. See Citron, "Pageantry and Theatre in the Service of Jewish Nationalism in the United States: 1933–1946," cited in Ruedenberg, "Analysis," 4.

3. The details surrounding this first memorial are culled from an unpublished manuscript, "The Case of the Memorial," by A. R. Lerner, part of the Schneiderman Archives at YIVO Institute of Jewish Research in New York.

4. *Ibid.*, 4.

5. *New York Times*, 18 Jan. 1950.

6. "City Rejects Park Memorials to Slain Jews," *New York Times*, 11 Feb. 1965: 1; and "2 Jewish Monuments Barred from Park," *New York World Telegram and Sun*, 10 Feb. 1965: 1.

7. From a letter dated May 1974 to friends and colleagues, signed by the executive committee of the Memorial to the Six Million Jewish Martyrs, Inc. At the time of this writing, a state-sponsored, privately funded "living memorial to the Holocaust"—the Museum of Jewish Heritage—is planned for a site on the Battery in New York, near the site proposed for Kahn's monument. To date, it has received substantial financial support but remains mired in a slow economy, burdened further by its ambitious scale. Like its predecessors, the Museum of Jewish Heritage seems cursed by the very breadth and depth of the community in New York that has so long demanded a memorial equal to its size and importance.

8. From "A Presentation on Behalf of the Babi Yar Park Foundation" (Denver, n.d.), unpaginated. For this and other materials on the Babi Yar Park, I am indebted to Helen J. Ginsburg, one of the memorial's founders, who very generously supplied me with a complete record of the park's conception and construction. In providing me with further details of the local discussion, Michael Allen, the director of Denver's Holocaust Awareness Institute, was also extremely helpful and generous with his time and insights.

9. These and other details are culled from a personal interview with Michael Jacobs at the Memorial Center for Holocaust Studies in Dallas on 23 Aug. 1990.

10. From a press release dated 22 April 1990, quoted in Peter Ember, "Images of Light," *Bronx Herald Statesman*, 10 June 1990.

11. For information on the Hohokam tribe and their petroglyphs, I am indebted to Fred Steiniger, one of the Tucson memorial's founders and builders, who provided me with a study of Native American petroglyphs by Sally J. Cole, *Legacy on Stone: Rock Art of the Colorado Plateau and Four Corners Region* (Boulder, 1990).

12. From a telephone interview with Otto Schirn, 19 June 1991.

13. From a telephone conversation with Joseph Young, 19 June 1991.

14. See Naomi Pfefferman, "Martyrs' Memorial: Creating the Dream," *Jewish Journal*, 28 April–4 May, 1990: 22.

15. Leo Noonan, "The New Holocaust Museum Has a New Idea," *The Jewish Journal*, 4-10 Nov. 1989: 30.

16. For several discussions of Marvin Hier's and the Wiesenthal Center's controversial style and fundraising tactics, see Gary Rosenblatt, "The Simon Wiesenthal Center: State-of-the-art Activism or Hollywood Hype?" *Baltimore Jewish Times*, 14 Sept. 1984: 62-74; Sheldon Teitelbaum and Tom Waldman, "The Unorthodox Rabbi," *Los Angeles Times Magazine*, 15 July 1990: 6-11, 35-39; and Miller, *One by One by One*, 236-51. Though the Wiesenthal Center subsequently corrected a handful of specific inaccuracies in Miller's book, the author has stood by her interpretive conclusions regarding the center's propriety and tastefulness. For further discussion of the Los Angeles memorials, see Terry Pristin, "3 Perspectives on the Holocaust," *Los Angeles Times*, 12 June 1991: B-1, B-4.

17. There are several versions of the Wiesenthal Center's genesis, none confirmed by Rabbi Hier. In one version, Hier was sitting with friends around the dinner table in August 1977, "having [his] Shabos chulent . . . and telling a friend at the dinner table what a shame it is that there is no equivalent of a Yad Vashem in the United States." He realized then and there, according to this report, that "it will never happen unless we do it ourselves" (Rosenblatt, "Wiesenthal Center," 65). Within days, he was off on a plane with his wife and financial backers to meet with Simon Wiesenthal in Vienna and propose a Holocaust center that would be named after the famed Nazi hunter.

In another, less flattering version, Hier was sitting with others in the courtyard of Hier's newly acquired building on Pico Boulevard to plan the first fundraising banquet for his new Yeshiva. When they realized that the date of the banquet, Nov. 12, fell near Kristallnacht, Mara Kochba reported that Hier "chortled with glee—and declared, 'We're in business'" (Teitelbaum and Waldman, "Unorthodox Rabbi," 35). Hier angrily disputes the language and insinuations of both accounts.

18. Teitelbaum and Waldman, "Unorthodox Rabbi," 10.

19. Thomas Albright, "The Holocaust Memorial: A Critical View of the Concept for S. F. Sculpture," *San Francisco Chronicle*, 16 April 1983: 36.

20. "Statement of Purpose," Mayor Dianne Feinstein's Committee for a Memorial to the Six Million Victims of the Holocaust, p. 2.

21. Michael Brenson, "Why Segal Is Doing Holocaust Memorial," *New York Times*, 8 April 1983: C16; and Matthew Baigell, "Segal's Holocaust Memorial," *Art in America*, Summer 1983: 136.

22. Phyllis Tuchman, *George Segal* (New York, 1983), 19.

23. Baigell, "Segal's Holocaust Memorial," 136.

24. Douglas C. McGill, "Making of 'Holocaust,'" *New York Times*, 10 Jan. 1986: C-20.

25. William Wilson, "Segal: Private Visions in the Public Arena," *Los Angeles Times*, 19 Aug. 1984: 91.

26. Brenson, "Why Segal Is Doing Holocaust Memorial," C-16.

27. "A Sense of Stillness," *Art News*, Summer 1983: 12.

28. See "Editor's Mailbox," *San Francisco Examiner*, 11 Aug. 1983.

29. See Thomas Albright, "The Holocaust Memorial: A Critical View of the Concept for S.F. Sculpture," *San Francisco Chronicle*, 16 April 1983; and Allan Temko, "The Virtues and Flaws of the Segal Sculpture," *San Francisco Chronicle*, 8 Nov. 1984.

30. A survivor and president of the Holocaust Center of Northern California, Michael Thaler, told the author at one point, "I like the site because when the killing happened, the birds sang, the sun shone and still we were killed." From an interview with the author in San Francisco, 24 April 1990.

31. William Wilson, "'The Holocaust' Unveiled in San Francisco," *Los Angeles Times*, 9 Nov. 1984: 13.

32. Douglas C. McGill, "A Muted Dedication for 'Holocaust,'" *New York Times*, 4 Jan. 1986.

33. Beth Coffelt, "'The Holocaust' and the Art of War," *San Francisco Sunday Examiner and Chronicle Magazine*, 23 Oct. 1983: 15.

34. *Ibid.*, 12.

35. From "Resolution," reproduced as part of the monument's dedication proceedings brochure, 30 May 1985.

36. From "Draft: Remarks of Governor Kean, Liberty Park Monument Dedication," 30 May 1985, courtesy of the estate of Nathan Rapoport.

## Chapter 12. Memory and the Politics of Identity

Epigraph: Alex Krieger proposed these words as an inscription to be placed at the entrance to the new Holocaust memorial in Boston, which will be located on the Freedom Trail. As quoted in "Speaking to the Unspeakable," *Design Times*, March-April 1991.

1. Recall Alex Krieger's words, cited above.

2. For inviting me to sit in on these discussions and providing me with the minutes of committee meetings afterward, I am grateful to New England Holocaust Memorial Committee President Ruth B. Fein, its executive director, Stephen Dickerman, and its program coordinator, Katherine D. Kane.

3. See, for example, Jim Hight, "Divided in Memory," *Boston Sunday Herald Magazine*, 22 April 1990: 14-20.

4. "The New England Holocaust Memorial Competition Program," p. 1.

5. Otile McManus, "A Concrete Reminder of the Holocaust," *Boston Globe*, 12 April 1991: 86.

6. These and the other designers' statements have been supplied by the New England Holocaust Memorial Committee.

7. Robert Campbell, "Rich Images Enhance Holocaust Memorial," *Boston Globe*, 25 June 1991: 56.

8. From the U.S. Code Annotated, Title 36 (Patriotic Societies and Observances), Chap. 46 (United States Holocaust Memorial Council), Sect. 1401.

9. From Appendix C, "Address by President Jimmy Carter," printed in "President's Commission on the Holocaust: Report to the President," 27 Sept. 1979, 26. For more on the political context surrounding Carter's decision to establish a Holocaust memorial in Washington, D.C., see the introduction to this section on American memorials, as well as much more comprehensive discussions of the memorial's political origins by Michael Berenbaum and Judith Miller, cited earlier.

10. Charles Maier, *The Unmasterable Past: History, Holocaust, and German National Identity* (Cambridge, Mass., and London, 1988), 165.